

## PLANNING APPLICATIONS COMMITTEE

13 November 2014

| <u>UPRN</u>            | <u>APPLICATION NO.</u>   | <u>DATE VALID</u> |
|------------------------|--|-------------------|
|                        | 14/P3133   | 06/06/2013        |
| <b>Address:</b>        | <b>Building at 21 Eastfields Road and garages between 21-27 Eastfields Road, Mitcham, CR4 2LS</b>  |                   |
| <b>Ward</b>            | Figges Marsh   |                   |
| <b>Proposal</b>        | Application to discharge condition 6 [external facing materials] attached to the planning permission granted on the 1 May 2014 under reference 13/P3183 for the demolition of the existing two-bedroom property at 21 Eastfields Road and the adjacent 40 domestic garages and construction of a new three-storey building providing 21 flats [9 three bedroom maisonettes and 12 one bedroom flats] with 14 off street car parking spaces with vehicular access on to Eastfields Road, landscaping and a freestanding building providing cycle and bin storage. |                   |
| <b>Drawing No's</b>    | BH0566 160; BH0566-300 revision 02; BH 0566/002/DP/PP01 Schedule of Proposed External Materials dated 201014   |                   |
| <b>Contact Officer</b> | Tony Ryan [020 8545 3114]  |                   |

---

**RECOMMENDATION APPROVE DISCHARGE OF CONDITION 6 [External Facing Materials]**

---

### **CHECKLIST INFORMATION.**

- S106: N/A
  - Is an Environmental Statement required: No
  - Has an Environmental Impact Assessment been submitted – No
  - Press notice – No
  - Site notice – No
  - Design Review Panel consulted – No
    - Number of neighbours consulted – N/A
  - External consultations – N/A
  - PTAL: 3 [TFL Planning Information Database]
  - Density – N/A
  - Number of jobs created: N/A
-

## **1. INTRODUCTION**

- 1.1 This application to discharge the condition relating facing materials is brought before Committee for members' consideration, in accordance with the minutes of the meeting when the application for planning permission to develop the site was considered at the Planning Applications Committee meeting on the 5 September 2013.
- 1.2 The minutes of the meeting on the 5 September 2013 recorded the following:  
*"External Materials – Some Members expressed concern about the design of the proposed development, especially its bland appearance. Officers advised that the proposed external materials would need to be submitted to and approved by the Council further to proposed Condition (6), and suggested that, if appropriate, details of such materials could be submitted to the Committee for approval (instead of being dealt with by officers)". "The Committee subsequently agreed to this suggestion".*

## **2. SITE AND SURROUNDINGS**

- 2.1 The application site [0.3 hectares] is located on the north side of Eastfields Road [A217] to the east of the junction with Lansdell Road and at the location where Eastfields Road turns into Locks Lane. On the opposite side of Eastfields Road are the Eastfields Road allotments. The surrounding area is residential in character made up of two storey terraced dwellings.
- 2.2 The site is approximately 250 metres walking distance from Mitcham Eastfields Rail Station and 380 metres walking distance from Mitcham Town Centre [London Road]. The site has a Public Transport Accessibility Level rating of 3 (average access to public transport services). The site is located outside a controlled parking zone. The application site is not in an archeological priority area, and not in an area at risk from flooding [June 2012].
- 2.3 The application site is an awkward shape; with a frontage of 13 metres on to Eastfields Road opening up measuring 56 metres at the widest point in the centre of the site and then tapering to a width of 3.5 metres at the rear of the site. The building at 21 Eastfields Road at the front of the site is a part one, part two storey detached building constructed at an angle of 30 degrees to the 13 metre long Eastfields Road site frontage. This building has been vacant for 12 years. The front part of the ground floor was previously in use as an estate agents office, with the rear part of the ground floor and the first floor previously in residential use.

- 2.4 The remaining part of the site frontage adjacent to 19 Eastfields Road provides vehicle access to 40 single storey garages located to the side and rear of 21 Eastfields Road. These garages are arranged in four blocks. The application site also includes a triangular shaped piece of open land separated from the garages by a row of mature trees and behind the existing nearby properties at 63 to 81 Fernlea Road. The entrance to a pedestrian footpath [Public Right of Way 147] is located between the building at 21 Eastfields Road and the adjacent residential property at 27 Eastfields Road. This footpath running to the side of 27 Eastfields Road and behind properties in Guyatt Gardens and Ormerod Gardens provides pedestrian access to Slade Way.
- 2.5 The Council currently owns the building at 21 Eastfields Road after it was the subject of a Compulsory Purchase Order. It was found that this building and the adjacent forty garages were in a poor condition and as a result were having a detrimental impact on local amenity. The aim of the Compulsory Purchase Order was to bring the property at 21 Eastfields Road into the Council's ownership and subsequently to facilitate the redevelopment of the land at the rear of the property. The Compulsory Purchase Order was obtained and the ownership of 21 Eastfields Road transferred to the Council on 17 December 2009.

### **3 CURRENT PROPOSAL**

- 3.1 The development of the site at 21 Eastfields Road involves the demolition of the detached two-bedroom house at 21 Eastfields Road and the adjacent 40 garages and the redevelopment of the site. The redevelopment of the site will provide a new three-storey terraced building providing 21 flats [9 three bedroom maisonettes and 12 one bedroom flats].
- 3.2 The current application seeks the discharge of condition 6 that reads as follows: *"No development shall take place until details of the facing materials to be to be used on the walls of the development hereby permitted, (notwithstanding any materials specified in the application form and/or the approved drawings), and the surfacing materials for the wider pavement at the front of the site have been submitted to the Local Planning Authority (Planning Applications Committee) for approval. No works, which are the subject of this condition, shall be carried out until the details are approved, and the development shall be carried out in full accordance with the approved details"*.
- 3.3 The stated reason for condition 6 was: *"To ensure a satisfactory appearance of the development and to comply with policy BE.23 of the Adopted Merton Unitary Development Plan 2003"*.

- 3.4 The proposed facing materials submitted to discharge condition 6 are as follows:
- Facing brick at ground floor level: Edenhall Herne Steel;
  - Facing brick at first floor level floor level: Edenhall Redbridge Stock;
  - Render at second floor level: Weber Polar White
  - Paving to the front of the site: Marshalls red concrete Keybloc Paving and Formpave Aquaflow permeable vendage
- 3.5 In addition to the details of materials required to discharge 6 the applicant has also specified the following external materials.
- Windows and doors: Sovereign - Hazy Grey;
  - Rainwater goods, hoppers and copings: Grey PVC;
  - Balconies: galvanised steel frame, rail and supports with clear glass;
  - Juliette balconies: clear balcony infill panels.
- 3.6 The applicant has submitted samples of the proposed brick, render and paving to be used on the building. A drawing is attached to this agenda setting out the previously submitted material details.

#### **4. PLANNING HISTORY.**

- 4.1 Planning permission was approved on the 1 May 2014 [13/P1383] for the demolition of the existing two-bedroom property at 21 Eastfields Road and the adjacent 40 domestic garages and construction of a new three-storey building providing 21 flats [9 three bedroom flats and 12 one bedroom flats] with 14 off street car parking spaces with vehicular access on to Eastfields Road, landscaping and a freestanding building providing cycle and bin storage.
- 4.2 Planning permission was refused in November 2012 [12/P1576] for the demolition of the existing two-bedroom property at 21 Eastfields Road and the adjacent 40 domestic garages and construction of two, three-storey buildings providing 26 flats [9 three bedroom flats, 9 two bedroom flats and 8 one bedroom flats] with 22 off street car parking spaces with vehicular access on to Eastfields Road, landscaping and a freestanding building providing cycle and bin storage. Planning permission was refused on the following grounds:
- 1. The design of the proposed development fails to respect the character and appearance of the local area with a layout that makes poor and inefficient use of this site contrary to the policy requirements in UDP policies BE.16 and BE.22 and policy CS.14 within the Council's Adopted Core Strategy [2011] and policies 7.4 and 7.6 of the London Plan.**
  - 2. The proposed development in terms of the general layout of residential accommodation and lack of any private external**

**amenity space fails to provide an acceptable standard of residential accommodation contrary to policy CS8 of the adopted Core Strategy; UDP policy HS.1 of the Unitary Development Plan Supplementary Planning Guidance New Residential Development and policy 3.5 of the London Plan.**

- 3. The proposed development will have a detrimental impact on the amenities of existing adjacent residential occupiers in terms of loss of daylight, loss of sunlight, loss of privacy and overlooking to adjacent properties and their rear gardens contrary to the objectives of UDP policies BE.15 and HS.1 and Supplementary Planning Guidance on Residential Development.**
- 4.3 An appeal to the Secretary of State against the Council's refusal of planning permission for this development was dismissed on the 8 August 2013.
- 4.4 In September 2007 the Planning Applications Committee resolved to approve planning permission [07/P2048] subject to a s106 legal agreement for the redevelopment of the site involving the demolition of all existing buildings and erection of 10 one bedroom, 11 two bedroom and 4 three bedroom flats in 2 three storey blocks with an access road and associated car parking (25 spaces). As the applicant chose not to proceed with the legal agreement there was no final decision taken on this application and it was withdrawn in June 2010.
- 4.5 Outline planning permission was refused in July 2003 [03/P1070] for the redevelopment of the site involving the demolition of all existing buildings and erection of 2 three storey buildings to provide 12 two bedroom and 21 one bedroom flats with access road and associated car parking. Planning permission was refused on the grounds that the development would represent an over-intensive development which fails to reinforce locally distinctive patterns of development, detrimental to the character and visual amenities of the area, and which would result in an unacceptable loss of open space in an area designated deficient in open space provision. The proposed buildings were considered to provide substandard accommodation for future occupiers and represent an unneighbourly and intrusive form of development, likely to give rise to overlooking and loss of privacy for neighbouring residential occupiers.
- 4.6 Planning permission [96/P1087] was approved in March 1997 for the alteration and extension of the building at 21 Eastfields Road including a part single/part two storey rear extension and a front porch extension in connection with the use of the property as a four bedroom dwelling house involving the change of use of the ground floor estate agents office (class A2). This planning permission was never implemented and the vacant

building is still laid out with an estate agents office on part of the ground floor with the remaining space in residential use.

- 4.7 Planning permission was granted in March 1954 for the erection of 40 lock up garages on part of the current application site.

5. **CONSULTATION**

- 5.1 Whilst the choice of proposed external materials was raised as a matter of concern by the Planning Applications Committee, this issue was not raised in responses to the full public consultation carried out on the original planning application.

- 5.2 In view of these circumstances, with the earlier public consultation officers have not considered it expedient to undertake further public consultation with regards to the discharge of this planning condition.

6 **POLICY CONTEXT**

**The London Plan [July 2011].**

- 6.1 The relevant policies in the London Plan [July 2011] are 3.5 [Quality and design of housing developments; 7.4 [Local character]; 7.5 [Public realm]; and 7.6 [Architecture].

**Merton Supplementary Planning Guidance**

- 6.2 Design [2004].

**Policies within the Merton LDF Core Planning Strategy [July 2011]**

- 6.3 The relevant policies within the Council's Adopted Core Strategy [July 2011] is CS.14 [Design].

**Merton Sites and Policies Plan [adopted July 2014]**

- 6.4 The London Borough of Merton 'Sites and Policies Plan' was formally adopted by the Council on the 9 July 2014. The relevant policies within the Sites and Policies Plan are as follows: DMD1 [Urban Design and the Public Realm] and DMD2 [Design Considerations and the Public Realm].

**National Planning Policy Framework [March 2012]**

- 6.5 The National Planning Policy Framework [NPPF] was published on the 27 March 2012 and replaces previous guidance contained in Planning Policy Guidance Notes and Planning Policy Statements. This document is a key part of central government reforms '...to make the planning system less complex and more accessible, and to promote sustainable growth'.

- 6.6 The NPPF supports the plan led system stating that development that accords with an up to date plan should be approved and proposed development that conflicts should be refused. The framework also states that the primary objective of development management should be to foster

the delivery of sustainable development, and not to hinder or prevent development.

- 6.7 The NPPF states that design policies should avoid unnecessary prescription or detail and should concentrate on guiding the overall scale, density, massing, height, landscape, layout, materials and access of new development in relation to neighbouring buildings and the local area more generally. The guidance goes on to state that planning policies and decisions should not attempt to impose architectural styles or particular tastes and they should not stifle innovation, originality or initiative through unsubstantiated requirements to conform to certain development forms or styles. It is, however, proper to seek to promote or reinforce local distinctiveness.

## **7. PLANNING CONSIDERATIONS**

- 7.1 The planning considerations relate to an assessment of the acceptability of the submitted materials in terms of the overall appearance of the development as well as the local area.
- 7.2 Sites and policies plan policy DM D2 states that proposals for development will be expected to relate positively and appropriately to the materials used on surrounding buildings. Proposals for development will be expected to use appropriate materials which complement and enhance the character of the wider setting. Core Strategy Policy CS 14 require proposals to be well designed and to respond to, and reinforce locally distinctive patterns of development.

### Existing character and appearance

- 7.3 The original property on the application site has an external facing material of white render. The distinctiveness of the area surrounding the application site is made up by the variety of external materials that are present on nearby buildings.
- 7.4 The properties to the east of the application site in Eastfields Road are constructed of red brick with tile hanging on the roof gable, with properties beyond in red brick and render. The properties to the west of the application site have red brick at ground floor level with an off white/grey render on the upper parts of the building with properties further to the west finished in white render and red brick.

### Design and appearance of the proposed facing materials.

- 7.5 The proposed development includes the use of grey brick at ground floor level, and a red brick at first floor level. A render is proposed at second floor level and at first floor level above the entrances to the upstairs accommodation. The new building will be set back from the site frontage, and these materials and the use of different facing materials and the

combination of brick and render are considered to reflect the materials and appearance of existing properties nearby. The surfacing materials for the wider pavement at the front of the site will consist of block paving.

- 7.6 In response to the planning condition the applicant has submitted details and samples of these facing materials. The grey facing brick at ground floor level will be Edenhall Herne Steel. This brick is of a light grey colour and is of a colour similar to the render to the existing properties to the west of the application site. This brick is considered acceptable as a facing brick both in terms of the local area and the location on the proposed building.
- 7.7 It is proposed that the facing brick at first floor level floor level will be Edenhall Redbridge Stock. This brick is a light red brick that has a similar colour and appearance to the existing facing bricks on neighbouring properties. It is considered that the use of this brick will add interest to the building elevations and is considered acceptable in this location on the building and in terms of the local area.
- 7.8 The design of the building includes the use of render at second floor level. This render which will be a 'Polar White' is also used at first floor level to the front elevation above the entrances to the upstairs accommodation and on panels to the south west and east elevations. The proposed render is similar to the facing material present on neighboring buildings. The render will add interest to the elevations and increase the legibility of the building by highlighting the entrances to the upstairs accommodation in the front elevation.
- 7.9 The land to the front of the proposed building provides landscaping, car parking and pedestrian and vehicle access space. It is proposed that the parking and vehicle access areas are surfaced in Formpave Aquaflo permeable vendage paving, which is a block paving of a blue/ grey colour. The pedestrian access footpaths directly to the front of the proposed building will be paved in Marshalls concrete red Keybloc paving. This type and colour of paving is considered acceptable in this location and will provide an attractive and durable surface and an appropriate setting for the proposed building.
- 7.10 In addition to the details of materials required to discharge 6 the applicant has also specified the following external materials. windows and doors: Sovereign - hazy grey; grey rainwater goods, hoppers and copings: grey PVC balconies: galvanised steel frame, rail and supports with clear glass; Juliette balconies: clear balcony infill panels. These materials are considered acceptable and in keeping with the overall appearance of the building.



Alternative facing materials

- 7.11 The facing materials that have been described above are the developers preferred choice. In the event that the Planning Applications Committee does not consider these materials acceptable, alternative materials have been suggested by the developer. In terms of the red brick areas one of the following bricks are suggested Edmonton Stock Brick; Hemsby Crimson Sand Faced; Hendon Stock or Holkham Red. In terms of the grey brick areas the brick types of Mayfair Stock, or Selsey Silver Stock have been suggested. These are also considered to be acceptable.

**8. CONCLUSION**

- 8.1 Whilst not identical to those used on neighbouring buildings, the proposed facing materials used on this building would complement and be sympathetic to the materials used in the area surrounding the application site. Whilst the proposed building is set back slightly from the front boundary, the proposed facing materials on this new building would complement the Eastfields Road street scene. The proposed building and the facing materials are in accordance with adopted planning policies in the development plan.

**RECOMMENDATION**

**APPROVE DISCHARGE OF CONDITION 6 [External Facing Materials].**

This page is intentionally left blank